

Abraham C. Bloomenstiel
Dallas, TX
USA

אברהם חיים בלומנשטיל
דאלאס, טעקסעס
ארה"ב

February 18, 2022

To Whom it Will Concern:

I have been following the present dispute between Noahide Nations and Yeshiva Pirchei Shoshanim regarding Noahide Nations posting of my recorded video classes on YouTube. I have spoken with both sides, and both have asked me to make statements on their behalf.

Although I have taught for both organizations in the past, I have no present affiliation with either of them. I am not beholding to either in any way, and I don't see the necessity for my involvement in a conflict in which I have no present role. Nevertheless, I feel compelled to write this letter to clarify several details of the present conflict.

In 2014, Pirchei Shoshanim contacted me to research, write, and develop a comprehensive course on the Noahide Laws. It was clear from the outset that Pirchei Shoshanim would own the copyright to the course materials, as they do with most all of the materials that they produce. It was at my suggestion and insistence that Noahide Nations be brought into the project. I had a prior relationship with Ray Pettersen and greatly respected his dedication and accomplishments in spreading awareness of the *sheva mitzvos benei Noah*. It was, in my view, essential to have someone who knew the Noahide movement involved in the development of the course. Ray and Noahide Nations became an essential partner and adviser in developing the course. Importantly, Ray also provided a platform for teaching the course over the internet. These original classes were recorded and have become the subject of the present dispute.

In 2017, I was moving on to other projects and notified Ray that I was unable to continue teaching for him. I also notified Pirchei Shoshanim that I was not going to develop any further course materials. At that time, now that the course was completed, I signed the paperwork confirming Pirchei Shoshanim as the copyright holder and owner of the course materials. It is important to emphasize that, from the very beginning of developing the Noahide Laws course, it was understood that Pirchei Shoshanim owned the course materials.

The present dispute between Noahide Nations and Pirchei Shoshanim is not about the ownership of the written course materials. Rather, it is a dispute over the ownership of the recorded videos of the original classes. This dispute boils down to a legitimate legal question as to whether the videos are included in Pirchei Shoshanim's copyright, or are merely "derivative works," in which case they are the property of Noahide Nations. In my professional life as an attorney, I have dealt with many similar disputes. Arguments over the scope of copyrights are commonplace in the world of business and trademark law, and this dispute is no exception. There is no greater scandal or conspiracy at play; it is a rather commonplace question of copyright law.

Both sides have legitimate arguments to support their positions, and I have discussed my personal opinions on the matter with both sides. However, I do not own the videos and my opinion does not prove or settle the question (I cannot give either side permission to do anything with the videos because they are not my property).

I have advised both sides that they need to address this dispute in the proper manner. The “proper manner” contemplates only two possibilities: 1) a compromise between the parties, or 2) have the ownership of the videos determined in court. Those are the only two means of resolving the issue. There is no third option and there is certainly no place for this dispute in the public arena. All the more so, there is no place to engage in childish ad hominem attacks on social media, bashing each other’s reputations publicly, or by “building coalitions” and forcing other organizations or individuals to take sides. These tactics are disgusting and despicable, and I beg anyone reading this letter to not become a pawn in such reprehensible ploys.

Both Noahide Nations and Pirchei Shoshanim are respectable institutions that have done tremendous good for the Jewish and Noahide communities. I hope and pray that they both continue to succeed in their endeavors. If both organizations truly care about spreading Torah knowledge, then they will seek to resolve this in a way that will allow them both to continue in their respective missions. To repeat: this dispute must be resolved either through compromise or court, and not through lurid social media campaigns or blog posts.

If one side does choose to engage in a course of action that is below its dignity, and launches public attacks or exposés against the other, then it is a sure sign that the attacking party does not care about Torah or truth. If this should happen, then I encourage you to avoid any further involvement with such organization. Abandon them to their dark devices. They have no place in the world of Torah.

May HaShem grant peace to His world and its inhabitants,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'A. Bloomenstiel', with a stylized flourish at the end.

A. Bloomenstiel